

Co-funded by the Erasmus+ Programme of the European Union





TRANSNATIONAL EDUCATION IN 4 COUNTRIES OF THE ADRIATIC REGION Regulation, quality assurance and information provision

Table of contents

Introduction	2
TNE – concept and guiding principles	4
State of play on TNE in Croatia, Greece, Italy and Slovenia	8
o Croatia	8
o Greece	10
o Italy	_ 11
o Slovenia	_ 14
Conclusions	20

INTRODUCTION

This document has been developed in the framework of the AdReN project, which has the main objective of supporting automatic recognition among the countries of the Adriatic Area, starting from project partners, the ENIC-NARIC centres of Italy, Croatia, Greece and Slovenia, extending it to the members of the AdReN network and to the entire Area, with a concentric-circle structure.

In this light, the state of play on transnational education (TNE) in AdReN partner countries (Croatia, Greece, Italy and Slovenia) has been analysed with the **aim of gaining a better understanding of how and to what extent automatic recognition can be applied to TNE**.

The "Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region"¹, also known in abbreviated form as the **Lisbon Recognition Convention** (**LRC**), states the principle that a qualification giving access to higher education in a State which is party to the Convention will also give access in other countries that are party to the same convention, unless a substantial difference can be demonstrated between the qualifications².

In line with this principle, the "Recommendation of the Council of the European Union on promoting automatic mutual recognition of higher education and higher secondary education and training qualifications and the outcomes of learning periods abroad"³ states that if a qualification allows access to higher education in one Member State, the same qualification also allows access in the other countries of the EU, without prejudice to the autonomy of higher education institutions to establish their own admission requirements⁴.

These principles also apply to TNE, object of articles IV.9 and VI.5 of the LRC. The two articles state that a Party to the Convention may make the recognition of qualifications issued by foreign educational institutions operating in its territory contingent upon specific requirements

¹ Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region, 11 April 1997, ETS n. 165.

² <u>Ibid</u>., art. IV.1, IV.3, V.1 and VI.1.

³ Council of the European Union (2018), <u>Council Recommendation 2018/C 444/01 of 26 November 2010</u> on promoting automatic mutual recognition of higher education and upper secondary education and training qualifications and the outcomes of learning periods abroad.

⁴ <u>Ibid</u>., Key principles, para. 1, a) i).

of national legislation or specific agreements concluded with the Party of origin of such institutions.

Over the years, the importance of promoting good practices in TNE as well as ensuring the quality of both institutions and study programmes has become a central point, as stressed in the 2007 Revised Code of Good practices in the provision of transnational education⁵. Taking into consideration that sharing information on TNE institutions and the measures taken to ensure recognition of their qualifications at national level is pivotal to achieve automatic recognition, this document gives an overview of how the phenomenon is addressed in the Adriatic Area.

The document begins with a brief introduction to the concept of TNE, while the following chapter - the core section of the text - describes the state of the art on TNE in Croatia, Greece, Italy and Slovenia with a focus on:

- Implementation of the LRC, making particular reference to any specific requirements based on which qualifications issued by foreign educational institutions operating in the 4 countries are evaluated (i.e., national legislation, specific agreements, status of the institution).
- Information provided on TNE institutions operating in the national context.
- Types of TNE institutions operating in the national context.

⁵ Council of Europe/UNESCO, "Revised Code of Good Practice in the Provision of Transnational Education", Council of Europe/UNESCO, 2007.

TNE – concept and guiding principles

The Revised Code of Good practices in the provision of transnational education contains the following definition of TNE: "All types and modes of delivery of higher education study programmes, or sets of courses of study, or educational services (including those of distance education) in which the learners are located in a country different from the one where the awarding institution is based. Such programmes may belong to the education system of a State different from the State in which it operates or may operate independently of any national education system"⁶.

The recognition of qualifications awarded in the framework of TNE is described in articles IV.9 and VI.5 of the LRC⁷:

- "For the purpose of admission to programmes of higher education, each Party may make the recognition of qualifications issued by foreign educational institutions operating in its territory contingent upon specific requirements of national legislation or specific agreements concluded with the Party of origin of such institutions." (Art. IV.9)⁸.
- "Each Party may make the recognition of higher education qualifications issued by foreign educational institutions operating in its territory contingent upon specific requirements of national legislation or specific agreements concluded with the Party of origin of such institutions." (Art. VI.5)⁹.

Considering that TNE encompasses a wide range of phenomena and different types of institutions, the Revised Code of Good practices in the provision of transnational education highlights the importance of promoting good practices in the area of TNE, with particular reference to the quality of the provision of study programmes and the standards of qualifications issued by the Parties to the LRC. What's more, the Revised Code states a set of principles to which TNE institutions should adhere:

⁶ The same definition is used in "European Area of Recognition- EAR Manual", and in "<u>The European Recognition Manual for Higher Education</u> Institutions" (EAR-HEIs), third edition, February 2020.

⁷ Lisbon Recognition Convention, cit.

⁸ <u>Ibid</u>., art. IV.9.

⁹ <u>Ibid</u>., art. VI.5.

- 1 Transnational arrangements should be so elaborated as to widen access to higher education studies, to support the full development of individuals, and to comply with the national legislation regarding higher education in both receiving and sending countries.
- 2 Academic quality and standards of TNE programmes "should be comparable to those of the parent awarding institution(s), if any, and respect the criteria and provision for quality assurance and/or accreditation systems of the home country as well as be recognized in an appropriate way by the receiving country whether as legitimate foreign education or part of the host education system".
- **3** The policy and the mission statement established through transnational arrangements as well as the goals, objectives and contents of specific programmes should be published.
- 4 Provision of information given by the awarding institution, providing organisation, or agent to prospective students and to those registered for a study programme established through transnational arrangements should be appropriate, accurate, consistent and reliable.
- **5** Proficiency of staff members in terms of qualifications, teaching, research, and other professional experience.
- **6** TNE arrangements should encourage the awareness and knowledge of the culture and customs of both the awarding institutions and receiving country among the students and staff.
- **7** Responsibility of the awarding institution for the agents appointed to act on behalf of the awarding institution or its partner institution.
- **8** Responsibility of awarding institutions for issuing the qualifications resulting from their transnational study programmes.
- **9** Comparability of admission, teaching/learning activities, examination and assessment requirements to those specific programmes delivered by the awarding institution.
- **10** Comparability of the academic workload among transnational study programmes and awarding institution study programmes.
- **11** Compliance of qualification assessments with the Council of Europe/UNESCO Recognition Convention and its subsidiary texts.

The Diploma Supplement, as a tool of transparency, provides clear indications on information that should be provided in case of qualifications awarded in the framework of TNE arrangements. More specifically, information should be provided regarding the name of the qualification (point 2.1: "If the qualification is a joint/double degree or it was earned under a transnational or borderless education arrangement, this should be indicated"¹⁰), the name and status of the awarding institution (point 2.3 "If the provider is transnational or borderless, this should be clearly noted"¹¹) and name and status of the institution administering the studies, if different (point 2.4 "Cases are known in which a higher education institution entitles another institution to deliver its programmes and issue its qualifications through a "franchise" or some type of "validation", "affiliation", etc. In some cases, a branch campus may be located in a different country. If this is the case, it should be indicated here. If there is a difference between the awarding institution and the institution delivering the programme leading to the qualification, indicate the status of both"¹²).

Looking to practices, so far there is no systematic analysis of how the recognition of qualifications awarded through TNE works in practice.

In the first report on "Monitoring the implementation of the Lisbon Recognition Convention", there is no specific question on the recognition of qualifications awarded in a TNE institution. The only reference to TNE in the report is linked to the recognition of joint degrees.

¹⁰ The Committee of the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region, <u>Revised</u> template for Diploma Supplement, 2019.

¹¹ <u>Ibid</u>.

¹² <u>Ibid</u>.

Types of TNE institutions¹³

- O Branch Campuses: campuses established in a country by a foreign higher education institution offering its own educational programmes/qualifications regardless of the origin of the students.
- Off-shore institutions: autonomous institutions established in a country but belonging, in terms of their organisation and contents, to the educational systems of other countries. These institutions are established in foreign countries but do not have parent awarding institution in the country whose educational system is used as reference.
- O Franchised Institutions/Programmes: the teaching institution and the awarding institution do not coincide. The teaching institution operates in a country different from that of the awarding institution and offers programmes and degrees as well as issues qualifications, in accordance with the conditions stipulated in the franchise agreement. These agreements are mainly commercial in nature and not always related to academic purposes. Franchised Institutions are not checked by any Quality Assurance agencies.
- O International HE Institutions: institutions which do not officially belong to any national higher education system. They are usually established by international organisation or are the result of international, bilateral or multilateral agreements.
- O Multinational Corporate Universities: institutions which are usually launched by big transnational corporations and organise their own higher education study programmes, offering qualifications which do not belong to any national education system. These qualifications are more targeted towards labour market and thus accreditation is not prioritised by these institutions.

¹³ Lantero, L., Finocchietti, C., & Petrucci, E., "Substantial differences. A glimpse of theory and practice", 2021, p. 16.

State of play on TNE in Croatia, Greece, Italy and Slovenia

This chapter provides an overview of TNE in Croatia, Greece, Italy and Slovenia starting from articles IV.9 and VI.5 of the LRC and placing particular emphasis on the following topics:

- Existence of specific requirements based on which qualifications issued by foreign educational institutions operating in the 4 countries are evaluated (i.e., national legislation, specific agreements, etc.).
- Information made publicly available (list of TNE institutions published and available).
- Types of TNE institutions operating in the national context.
- Good practices.

Croatia

Understanding of TNE is in line with the LRC and its Subsidiary Text, Code of good practice in the provision of TNE. The definition of TNE used in Croatia is the one provided in the text of the Revised code of good practice in the provision of transnational education:

"Transnational education - All types and modes of delivery of higher education study programmes, or sets of courses of study, or educational services (including those of distance education) in which the learners are located in a country different from the one where the awarding institution is based. Such programmes may belong to the education system of a State different from the State in which it operates, or may operate independently of any national education system"¹⁴.

The Croatian higher education system is regulated by the Act on Scientific Activity and Higher Education (Official Gazette 123/03, 198/03, 105/04, 174/04, 02/07, 46/07, 45/09, 63/11, 94/13, 139/1. 3, 101/14, 60/15) and in accordance with this Act:



¹⁴ "Revised Code of Good Practice in the Provision of Transnational Education", cit.

article 76. (7): "A foreign higher education institution may conduct its studies on the territory of the Republic of Croatia provided that: the said higher education institution and the studies it conducts are accredited in the home country, that the said higher education institution is entered in the Register of Higher Education Institutions institution at the Commercial Court in the Republic of Croatia, and that the study, according to the procedure prescribed by the Minister, is accredited by the national accreditation body of the Republic of Croatia".

The adopted Act on Quality Assurance in Science and Higher Education (Official Gazette 45/09) defines internal and external quality assurance systems at the national level and the activities and establishment of the Agency for Science and Higher Education (ASHE) as a public institution in the Republic of Croatia tasked with quality assurance and improvement in science and higher education. External quality assurance procedures carried out by ASHE share some common characteristics, but as the processes differ in scope, goals and methodologies, there are certain differences in their outcomes and implementation, as well. Procedures and steps of each type of external evaluation are available on ASHE's website along with detailed information.

The Directory of Study Programmes lists all accredited higher education institutions and study programmes in the Republic of Croatia, which can be searched according to a number of criteria.

Amendments to the Act on Scientific Activity and Higher Education are underway, aiming to regulate this area in detail.

Greece



Transnational education diplomas and degrees are mainly offered by franchised institutions (called "Colleges") in Greece. Colleges are educational institutions of non-formal postsecondary education. They provide study programmes for which they are required to have validation and franchise agreements with higher education institutions (Universities) abroad, recognised by the competent authorities in the country of residence. The studies provided in the above context lead to a first degree (bachelor) of at least three years of study or to a postgraduate degree (master). Colleges offer exclusive educational services under the above agreements. Colleges can also provide studies, provided that the specific study programmes have received accreditation from international certification bodies.

Article 16 of the Hellenic Constitution states that only State Universities are allowed to provide tertiary education in Greece. Thus, the degrees conferred by those Colleges, in agreement with foreign Universities, are not recognized academically by DOATAP and that constitutes the main substantial difference.

Article 4 of the L.3328/2005 mentions that "The entire studies should take place in recognised Educational Institutions and at least 1/2 of the program has to be done at the University that confers the degree".

However, the Presidential Decree 38/2010 "Adaptation of Greek legislation to Directive 2005/36/ EC¹⁵ of the European Parliament and of the Council of 7 September 2005 on the recognition of professional qualifications and other matters" (Government Gazette 78), as amended and still in force, incorporates all the directives for the professional recognition of such degrees.

The recognition of professional equivalence of a formal higher education degree of a Member State of the European Union with that awarded under the domestic education system, in accordance with paragraph 3 of article 2 (PD 38/2010), enables the beneficiary to gain access to Greece and to engage in a specific economic activity as an employee or self-employed

¹⁵ Directive 2005/36/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 7 September 2005 on the recognition of professional qualifications.

worker with the same conditions and terms as the holders of comparable degrees of the domestic educational system, except in cases where increased academic qualifications are required and especially for positions of university professors, researchers and specialists.

There is a complete list of colleges which can be found at this link.

Italy

The LRC, was ratified in Italy with Law n.148 of 11 July, 2002: "Ratification and execution of the Convention on the Recognition of Qualifications concerning Higher Education in the European Region, completed in Lisbon, 11 April, 1997, and regulations for adaptation in national law".

By applying article VI.5 of the LRC¹⁶, Italy regulates recognition of academic qualifications issued by foreign universities operating in the Italian territory, subordinating the possibility of access to recognition procedures to a procedure of accreditation specific to the foreign institution, as established by Decree n. 214 of 26 April, 2004: "Regulation containing criteria and procedures for foreign institutes of higher education operating in Italy with a view to recognition of the qualification issued by them (implementation of article 4 of Law n.148 of 11 July, 2002)".

As stated in article 2, the institution and its programmes must be fully officially recognised in the foreign reference system, the access criteria and the recognition of qualifications completely in line with that of the institutions operating in the foreign system, as well as the requirements in place for the teaching staff, and the structures identified for carrying out teaching activities in Italy must be adequate for the purpose.

Analysing first the status of secondary education institutions offering final school leaving qualifications in Italy, foreign schools are recognised by the Italian state by virtue of bilateral

¹⁶ Lisbon Recognition Convention, cit.

or multilateral cooperation agreements in the field of education or based on international programmes and initiatives. Among these, we can include the foreign schools that operate in Italy on the basis of bilateral agreements and for which this agreement explicitly provides for the recognition of qualifications, the European Schools¹⁷, the schools authorised to issue the title of International Baccalaureate, and international schools such as the international school of Trieste. There are also institutions that fall into the category of "non-accredited private schools", that could be inserted in a register by the competent regional authorities and issue final qualifications without legal value in Italy, for the recognition of which a case-by-case assessment is required. A comprehensive overview of the regulatory framework, the main characteristics and an updated list of foreign schools operating in Italy is reported in the document "Foreign schools in Italy and Italian schools abroad. Legislation, characteristics and recognition of qualifications"¹⁸.

Moving to the Higher Educations sector, Law n. 4 of 14 January 1999, article 2, paragraphs from 1 to 5 regulates foreign university and higher education institution filiations in Italy. In paragraph 1, "filiations" in Italy of foreign universities and higher education institutions are meant to administer part of a study programme in Italy (for instance one semester) and addressed to students already enrolled in their respective universities or higher education institutions. Paragraph 2 establishes that, before starting their activities, filiations in Italy are authorised by the Ministry for Universities and Research, the Ministry of the Interior, and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation, after a check of the requirements and criteria. The following Ministerial directive of 23 May 2000 states the authorisation criteria for the activities of filiations of foreign universities and higher education institutions in Italy. Among the documents to be submitted to the Ministry for Universities and Research, there are: copy of the institution's charter, copy of the institution's act deliberating the establishment of a filiation in Italy, copy of the last financial statement, list of the programmes taught in the university in the home

¹⁷ The Italian legislation acknowledges the regulatory development of the European schools, up to the most recent Law n. 151 of 6 March 1996, which ratifies in Italy the "Convention relating to the Statute of the European Schools", signed in Luxembourg on 21 June 1994.

¹⁸ L. Lantero, C. Finocchietti, E. Gitto, A. Garner, "<u>Foreign schools in Italy and Italian schools abroad. Legislation, characteristics and recognition</u> of qualifications", CIMEA DOC 135, July 2021.

country and the subjects intended to be taught in Italy.

As previously mentioned, law n. 148 of 2002¹⁹ incorporates the LRC within the Italian law system. Art.4 establishes that article VI.5 of the Convention is regulated by further ministerial regulation.

The following types of TNE institutions operate in Italy:

- Branch campuses.
- Filiations (regulated by Law n.4 of 14 January 1999)²⁰.
- Off-shore institutions.
- Multinational corporate universities.

The list of TNE institutions operating in Italy is available online: "Italy and transnational education" (2004). An example of international institution operating in Italy is the European University Institute – EUI²¹.

The Ministerial Decree n. 214 of 26 April 2004²² represents a good practice of the implementation of the article VI.5²³ of the LRC in Italy, setting the criteria for the establishment of foreign higher education institutions within the Italian territory. As stated above, the institution and its programmes must be accredited/recognised in the educational system of reference, and at the same time, must fulfill specific requirements checked by Italian institutions. This is meant to ensure the recognition of qualifications awarded by TNE institutions in Italy.

¹⁹ Legge 11 luglio 2002, n.148 "Ratifica ed esecuzione della Convenzione sul riconoscimento dei titoli di studio relativi all'insegnamento superiore nella Regione europea, fatta a Lisbona l'11 aprile 1997, e norme di adeguamento dell'ordinamento interno", n.173 del 25-07-2002 - Suppl. Ordinario n. 151

²⁰ Legge 14 gennaio 1999, n. 4 "Disposizioni riguardanti il settore universitario e della ricerca scientifica, nonché il servizio di mensa nelle scuole", GU n.14 del 19-01-1999

²¹ More information on Italy country profile in the <u>ENIC-NARIC website</u>.

²² Decreto 26 aprile 2004, n. 214 "Regolamento recante criteri e procedure per gli istituti stranieri di istruzione superiore che operano in Italia ai fini del riconoscimento del titolo di studio da essi rilasciato (attuazione dell'articolo 4 della legge 11 luglio 2002, n. 148)", GU Serie Generale n.192 del 17-08-2004

²³ Lisbon Recognition Convention, cit.

Slovenia



Slovenia understands TNE in line with the LRC and its Supplementary act Code of good practice in the provision of transnational education. Especially with the principle that transnational arrangements should comply with the national legislation in both, receiving and sending countries.

The Higher Education Act (33. article c) defines and explains TNE as follows:

"The term "transnational higher education" pursuant to this Act shall mean all forms and methods of higher education in which an officially recognised study programme is carried out entirely or in part in a country other than that in which the institution responsible for the higher education programme has its registered office.

In the Republic of Slovenia, transnational higher education may be carried out or organised on the basis of a contract between a higher education institution accredited in the Republic of Slovenia and a foreign higher education institution carrying out officially recognised study programmes and issuing public documents in the country in which it has been established.

In the Republic of Slovenia, transnational higher education programmes may also be carried out by a foreign higher education institution or other foreign institution if the competent authorities of the country where the institution responsible for the higher education programme has its registered office recognise that if a transnational higher education programme is carried out the institution responsible for that programme and the programme itself are part of their higher education system, which shall be verified by the Slovenian Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education before the transnational education programme is carried out.

Higher education institutions accredited in the Republic of Slovenia in accordance with this Act may carry out transnational higher education abroad on the basis of a contract with an appropriate higher education institution abroad and may award Slovenian public documents.

The detailed conditions, methods and forms of transnational higher education, the compulsory elements of a contract on the provision of transnational higher education referred to in paragraphs two and four of this article, and the method for determining whether the conditions referred to in paragraph three of this article have been fulfilled shall be determined by the Slovenian Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education.

A document certifying the completion of transnational higher education carried out in the Republic of Slovenia as a part of the foreign higher education system shall be considered a foreign document and shall be subject to the procedure for the evaluation or recognition of education in the Republic of Slovenia."

In Slovenia operate and were operating the following types of TNE institutions:

- Franchised institution.
- Branch campus. The detailed conditions, methods and the compulsory elements of a contract are determined by the Slovenian Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (SQAA NAKVIS), which is also responsible for maintaining a public record of transnational education. Further details on: https://www.nakvis.si/international-cooperation/vti/?lang=en. Past collaborations with contract on Javna evidence visokošolskega transnacionalnega izobraževanja (only in Slovene): https://www.nakvis.si/akreditacije-in-evalvacije-v-visokem-solstvu/javne-evidence/.

Implementation of International Education Programmes Act (Zakon o izvajanju mednarodnih programov s področja vzgoje in izobraževanja (Uradni list RS, št. 46/16)/ (courtesy translation) enables delivery of the international **primary and secondary programmes** operating in a foreign language in Slovenia.

This Act (article 1) regulates the conditions for the implementation of international programs in the field of education, which in the Republic of Slovenia operate in a foreign language and have not acquired public validity in accordance with the Act governing the organization and financing of education, namely:

- an educational program accredited in a foreign country (a foreign program);
- the program of the International Organization of the European School, based in Brussels ("EB Program")²⁴;

²⁴ Slovenia ratified the Convention defining the Statute of the European Schools in 2004. Special provisions on some details regarding subjects, conversion of grades etc. are determined by the Rules on integration from the educational program of European schools into the Slovenian educational system (National Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia No. 46/16 http://www.pisrs.si/Pis.web/pregledPredpisa?id=PRAV12964). The European Baccalaureate Certificate gives general access to all higher education programs in Slovenia.

 \circ the program of the International Baccalaureate Office in Geneva (the IB program)²⁵.

The implementation of these programmes shall not be financed from Slovene public funds. A private kindergarten and school that implements such international programs may start implementing the program after entry in the register of private kindergartens and schools that implement international programs. The register is kept by the ministry responsible for education²⁶.

The case of good practice is in article 5 of the above-mentioned act, which defines equality of finished IB Diploma and EB programmes with Slovene secondary school leaving qualifications.

5. člen (listina o izobraževanju)

Article 5 (education certificate):

"(1) A certificate issued by a school, providing an international program, is a foreign document and shall be evaluated and recognized in accordance with the Assessment and Recognition Act.

(2) Notwithstanding the previous paragraph, the certificate issued in the European Schools program and IB program is equal to the official document of education issued in publicly valid educational programs (secondary leaving qualification) in accordance with the law governing primary education, secondary education and matura^{"27}.

²⁷ Unofficial translation of the articles. In original language:

²⁵ The IB Diploma is equivalent to the Slovenian general matura by The Matura Examination Act (Official Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia, no. 1/07 and 46/16-ZOFVI-L) Slovenia has regulated providing of the IB programmmes offered in Slovenia by The Rules on the delivery of the IB education programme (Official Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia, no. 67/04 in 44/08) (si). Provisions determine transition to the Slovenian education system taking into account all subjects and grades, comparable to the Slovenian program of gymnasia, conversion of IB grades into the Slovenian matura points, considering higher level of subjects and calculation of general success etc. The same rules apply to all IB Diplomas regardless of an accredited school provider. The IB Diploma gives general access to all higher education programmes in Slovenia. The European Baccalaureate Certificate gives general access to all higher education programs in Slovenia.

²⁶ Further details on Register zasebnih vrtcev in šol, ki izvajajo mednarodne programe (only in Slovene): <u>https://www.gov.si/drzavni-organi/</u> <u>ministrstva/ministrstvo-za-izobrazevanje-znanost-in-sport/storitve/</u>.

[&]quot;(1) Listina o izobraževanju, ki jo izda šola, ki izvaja mednarodni program iz 1. člena tega zakona, je tuja listina in se vrednoti in priznava v skladu z zakonom, ki ureja vrednotenje in priznavanje izobraževanja.

⁽²⁾ Ne glede na prejšnji odstavek je listina o zaključku izobraževanja, izdana v programu evropske šole in programu IB, enakovredna javni listini o zaključku izobraževanja, izdani v javno veljavnih izobraževalnih programih v skladu z zakonom, ki ureja osnovnošolsko izobraževanje, srednješolsko izobraževanje in maturo".

The European Schools - Schola Europaea (www.eursc.eu)

is an intergovernmental organization, which has established, finances, and administers a small group of multilingual international schools, bearing the title "European School", which exist primarily to offer an education to the children of European Union staff. They offer accreditation to other schools, bearing the title "Accredited European School", under national jurisdiction within EU member states to provide its curriculum (Nursery school, five years of Primary school and seven years of Secondary school).

General recognition of education, obtained in the European School programs, is stipulated by the Convention defining the Statute of the European Schools.

IB - International Baccaleureate Office (Geneva; <u>http://www.ibo.org</u>)

is a non-profit organization selling products and services to schools analogous to a franchise network. It offers four educational programmes: the IB Diploma Programme and the IB Careerrelated Programme for students aged 15 to 19, the IB Middle Years Programme for students aged 11 to 16, and the IB Primary Years Programme for children aged 3 to 12. All programmes or schools must be authorized by the IB.

	SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS		
COUNTRY	NATIONAL LEGISLATION	STATUS OF THE INSTITUTION	
Croatia	 Act on Scientific Activity and Higher Education (art. 76). Act on Quality Assurance in Science and Higher Education 	 Accredited in the home country. Entered in the national Register of Higher Education Institutions. The study is accredited by the national accreditation body. 	
Greece	• Presidential Decree 38/2010 (recognition of professional qualifications)	• Validation and franchise agreements with higher education institutions (Universities) abroad, recognized by the competent authorities in the country of residence.	
italy	 Ministerial Decree n. 214 of 26 April 2004 Law n. 148 of 11 July 2002 Law n. 4 of 14 January 1999 and Ministerial directive of 23 May 2000 	 Institution and its programmes must be fully officially recognised in the foreign reference system. the access criteria and the recognition of qualifications completely in line with those of the institutions operating in the foreign system. requirements for the teaching staff, and the structures identified for carrying out teaching activities must be adequate for the purpose. 	
Slovenia	 The Higher Education Act (33. Article c). Implementation of International Education Programmes Act 	 Transnational higher education may be carried out on the basis of a contract between a domestic accredited higher education institution and a foreign higher education institution carrying out officially recognised study programmes and issuing public documents in the country in which it has been established (conditions, methods, form of TNE and elements of contracts are determined by Slovenian Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education). Transnational higher education programmes may also be carried out by a foreign higher education institution or other foreign institution if the competent authorities of the reference country recognise that the institution responsible for that programme and the programme itself are part of their higher education system, which shall be verified by the Slovenian Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education International programmes status of institution is important for recognition and assessment of education procedure; for entry of international programmes into the register the status of the institution is important in the cases of International Organization of the European School, based in Brussels ("EB Program") and International Baccalaureate Office in Geneva (the IB program). 	

TYPES OF INSTITUTIONS	AVAILABLE LIST
Not specified	The Directory of Study Programmes
Mainly offered by franchised institutions ("Colleges" providing non-formal post- secondary education). The degrees conferred by those Colleges, in agreement with foreign Universities, are not recognized academically by DOATAP.	List of Colleges
 Branch campuses. Filiations. Off-shore institutions. Multinational corporate universities. Distance learning universities 	Italy and transnational education
 Franchised institution Branch campus. 	Public record on TNE is available online on NAKVIS website. https://www.nakvis.si/international- cooperation/vti/?lang=en

Conclusions

The "matching" articles IV.9 and VI.5 of the LRC require that recognition of qualifications issued by foreign educational/higher education institutions operating in a country different from the one they are located may be made contingent upon specific requirements. The 2007 Revised Code of Good Practice stresses the importance of focusing on the quality assurance and evaluation of programmes provided and qualifications issued. This is also meant to ensure transparency towards citizens who should have clear indications on the recognisability of the qualifications issued by the various types of TNE institutions.

Taking into consideration that compliance with articles IV.9 and VI.5 of the LRC and the provision of clear indications on the quality and standards of programmes and qualifications provided by TNE institutions is also a fundamental aspect in the achievement of the full implementation of automatic recognition, this document analyses how the AdReN partner countries address this phenomenon.

The first general consideration that can be shared analysing the data collected is that the framework concerning the higher education system is more defined compared to the one related to secondary education, and that three key elements with regard to TNE are regulation, quality assurance and information provision.

In addition to this, the information gathered in this document allows the identification of 3 main elements that, *mutatis mutandis*, emerged in all 4 countries. The first is that all 4 countries have specific regulations with regard to TNE, in compliance with the principle of LRC.

The second point is related to quality assurance. Looking at the application of article VI.5 of the LRC, it emerged that the status and recognition of the TNE institution both in the home system and in the foreign reference system is a fundamental aspect for a qualification to be recognised, as reflected in the national legislation. As a matter of fact, in all the countries involved in the study, foreign institutions and/or their programmes must be recognised in the country they belong in order to offer recognisable qualifications. In some cases, such as in Croatia, it is further specified that the institution must be inserted in the official national register and the study accredited by the relevant national institution.

The third point is that all the countries provide transparent information since they have public lists of foreign institutions operating on domestic soil.

This publication is the result of the AdREN – Automatic Recognition in the Adriatic Region Project, co-financed in the framework of the Erasmus+ programme of the European Union.



Developed by

CIMEA, Italy (coordinator) Agency for Science and Higher Education (ASHE), Croatia Hellenic National Recognition and Information Centre (DOATAP), Greece ENIC-NARIC Centre, Ministry of Higher education Science and Sport, Slovenia



The European Commission support for the production of this publication does not constitute an endorsement of the contents which reflects the views only of the authors, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

Date of publication: May 2022 © CIMEA 2022



Co-funded by the Erasmus+ Programme of the European Union